



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

## II.—THE HISTORICAL ATTITUDE OF LIVY.

Very little can be gleaned from later writers in regard to the personality of Livy, and critics are compelled to gather from his work the statements which portray his historical attitude. But few illustrations are needed of the principal elements of his character. Deeply religious (3, 20, 5; 6, 41, 8; 43, 13, 1), but not unmindful that religion might degenerate into superstition (27, 23, 2); a firm believer in the good old days of republican rule and righteousness (26, 22, 14; 39, 6, 6), and a skeptic on some points in early Roman history (1, 16, 4; 2, 10, 11; 2, 14, 3), he undertook to construct, out of official records, earlier annals, and traditional reports, not a mere annalistic account, but a history in accordance with the principles of literary art. Yet it was historical accuracy rather than literary adornment that he had in view. As he says 9, 17, 1 *nihil minus quaesitum a principio huius operis videri potest, quam ut plus iusto ab rerum ordine declinarem varietatibusque distinguendo opere et legentibus velut deverticula amoena et requiem animo meo quaererem.*

At the beginning of his work he did not comprehend the full extent of the field which he had undertaken to explore. This he frankly admits 31, 1, 5 *iam provideo animo, velut qui proximis litori vadis inducti mare pedibus ingrediuntur, quidquid progredior, in vastiorem me altitudinem ac velut profundum invehī, et crescere paene opus, quod prima quaeque perficiendo minui videbatur.* Still this failure to predetermine the extent of the field does not affect the value of the work any more than the value of McMaster's History of the People of the United States is affected by the fact that it is more extended than was at first designed. Mistaken at the outset in regard to the labor involved, the value of Livy's work is but little affected because there was no careful preview of the material he utilized.

There are but few statements which indicate an examination of original records. It is stated 6, 1, 2 that most of the early records perished at the capture of the city by the Gauls: *etiam si quae in commentariis pontificum aliisque publicis privatisque erant monumentis, incensa urbe pleraeque interiire.* Prior to this

date, as Livy frankly states, events are *res cum vetustate nimia obscuras, velut quae magno intervallo loci vix cernuntur*, and also in 4, 23, 2 *sed inter cetera vetustate incomperta hoc quoque in incerto positum*. For this period we can expect no more accuracy of statement than is to be found in traditional reports handed down through the centuries, and with inevitable modifications from changing conditions, social and political, and especially by the influence of great families whose progenitors were, or were supposed to be, the makers of early history. For this period the annalists could be of no service to Livy, for they stood, so far as the power of verification went, as far as did Livy himself from the events recorded, and though they might, under the guise of history, record fables and traditions, they could not furnish historical verities. Livy felt this (8, 40, 5) and for later times emphasizes the work of the annalists who stood nearest the events described (22, 7, 4; 21, 38, 2; 29, 14, 9).

After the Restoration following the burning of Rome, there grew up a variety of official records, but some of these perished in the civil convulsions, so that at some points Livy was dependent on the annalists for statements of facts which he could neither prove nor disprove. Though dependent upon these, he was well aware of the uncertainties as well as of the actual falsity of parts of this annalistic material. Some things were obscure because of their remoteness. Not only this, but Livy had learned that poetical fables had been woven into Roman history (Praef. 6); that the founders of cities misstated the source of the early population (1, 8, 5); that invention was possible in historical matters (8, 6, 3); that the truth had been perverted by great families (8, 40, 4); that statues and monuments did not fully decide historical facts, and that pseudo-orations might pass for the genuine (38, 56, 5). He had also noticed that the annalists were frequently at variance. When the annalistic current runs smoothly he is silent in regard to the source of his information; but there are frequent eddies, and it is here that he gives us variant opinions. A few quotations will sufficiently illustrate the entire number.

In the account of the capture of Carthago Nova 26, 49, after giving different accounts of the number of hostages, he adds *sec. 2, aequae et aliae inter auctores discrepant. praesidium Punicum alius decem, alius septem, alius haud plus quam duum milium fuisse scribit*. Reference is here made to at least three writers,

while in the account of the number of troops taken by Scipio into Africa 29, 25, 2 reference is made to five or more: *alibi decem milia peditum . . . alibi sedecim milia . . . alibi . . . quinque et triginta milia . . . invenio*. quidam non adiecere numerum, inter quos me ipse in re dubia poni malim. Coelius ut abstinere numero, ita ad immensum multitudinis speciem auget. Unharmonized accounts are also given for the details of the death and burial of Gracchus 25, 17; as well as in the case of Marcellus 27, 27, 12 multos circa unam rem ambitus fecerim, si, quae de Marcelli morte variant auctores, omnia exequi velim. ut omittam alios, Coelius triplicem gestae rei rationem edit: unam traditam fama, alteram scriptam in laudatione fili, qui rei gestae interfuerit, tertiam, quam ipse pro inquisita ac sibi conperta adfert. There is a similar confusion in regard to Scipio 38, 56, 1 multa alia in Scipionis exitu maxime vitae dieque dicta, morte, funere, sepulchro, in diversum trahunt, ut, cui famae, quibus scriptis adsentiar, non habeam; and 38, 57, 8 haec de tanto viro quam et opinionibus et monumentis litterarum variarent, proponenda erant.

The conclusion to be drawn from these and similar passages is that Livy had before him irreconcilable statements from different annalists, and that he himself was unable to furnish the correct data. His references indicate merely his own uncertainty, and give no indication of the extent of his indebtedness to the individuals in the construction of his work. His dealings with two writers will illustrate this. He mentions 34, 44, 7 a plot to burn Rome. Had 29, 22, 10 by some chance been lost, who could guess that Livy derived his information from Clodius Licinus? His treatment of Polybius is still more noticeable. The first mention of him is in 30, 45, 5, and there, as well as in later passages, 33, 10, 10; 34, 50, 6; 36, 19, 11; and 45, 44, 19 he is cited merely for isolated facts. More than this, in 39, 52, 1 Livy declines to accept the statements of Polybius and Rutilius in regard to the date of Scipio's death. Had the works of Polybius been lost, no critical acumen could, from the references to him as an authority for disconnected facts, accurately determine Livy's dependence either indirectly or directly on the Greek. The words of Polybius are necessary as a basis for comparison, and, in the case of the Latin annalists, the loss of the originals precludes the possibility of calculating the extent to which Livy is under obligations to his individual predecessors,

and dogmatic determinations of the question tend to arouse a spirit of historical agnosticism.

When the annalists disagree, Livy is usually content to leave the question undecided, and it would have been futile for him to attempt to restore lost facts. However, he sometimes gives a reason for the confusion (10, 9, 13); or by argument tries to obtain a rational solution (1, 18, 3; 2, 14, 2; 3, 55, 12; 4, 20, 5; 5, 33, 4; 21, 15, 3; 34, 50, 6). There is also an occasional reflection on the course of events: the work of Brutus 2, 1; the workings of factions 4, 9, 3; fortune attending valor 4, 37, 7; falling into danger while seeking to escape 8, 24, 4; the nature of the mob 24, 25, 8; 28, 27, 11; 31, 34, 3; reliance on home resources 25, 33, 6; equality in a free state 27, 31, 4; great things from small 27, 9, 1; proneness to envy 35, 43, 1. He frequently gives his inferences, as is indicated by his use of *credo*, and here and there says that certain things which had stood as vouchers for historical deeds had passed away. Of these may be mentioned the horns of the wonderful Sabine cow (1, 45, 4) *fixa per multas aetates cornua . . . monumentum ei fuere miraculo*; the statue of Attius (1, 36, 5) *statua Atti capite velato . . . in gradibus ipsis ad laevam curiae fuit, cotem quoque eodem loco sitam fuisse memorant*; of Cloelia (2, 13, 11) *in summa Sacra via fuit posita virgo insidens equo*; and of M. Anicius (23, 19, 18) *statua eius indicio fuit Praeneste in foro statuta*; the tablet put up by T. Quinctius 6, 29, 9 *his ferme incisa litteris fuit*; and the shield in honor of L. Marcius (25, 39, 17) *monumentum . . . usque ad incensum Capitolium fuisse in templo clipeum Marcium appellatum cum imagine Hasdrubalis*; 6, 4, 3.

That Livy was not a mere transcriber is still further shown by the number of references which he makes to himself and his work; and these are, in most instances, evoked by his knowledge of the untrustworthiness of the works which he had examined. Their differences in statement gave to him an opportunity for a frank avowal of his own inability to establish the truth. At times he says it is not his intention or that it is not worth while to discuss a subject: *Praef. 6 nec adfirmare nec refellere in animo est*; 5, 21, 9; 1, 24, 6 *non operae est referre*; 26, 34, 2; 33, 20, 13; 35, 40, 1; 41, 25, 8. The opposite view is taken 29, 29, 5 *operae pretium videtur excedere paulum ad enarrandum*. The apparent uselessness of effort is expressed with equal candor: 7, 6, 6 *cura non deesset, si qua ad verum via inquirentem ferret*; *nunc fama rerum standum est, ubi certam derogat vetustas fidem*; 8, 18, 2 *in eo*

parvi refert, quid veri sit ; 26, 49, 6 si aliquis adsentiri necesse est, media simillima veris sunt ; 29, 14, 9 sicut traditum a proximis . . . scriptoribus libens posteris traderem, ita meas opiniones coniectando rem vetustate obrutam non interponam ; 6, 12, 3 quod cum ab antiquis tacitum praetermissumque sit, cuius tandem ego rei praeter opinionem, quae sua cuique coniectanti esse potest, auctor sim ? 38, 56, 1. While such statements are fairly common, in most instances Livy gives an indication of his own position.

The Archiv Vol. X. pp. 80-81 gives the occurrences of two classes of verbs referring to Livy himself. The number for the different decades is 106-21-7-2, counting among them 1, 24, 1 hos ut sequar, inclinat animus ; 10, 5, 13 habeo auctores (also in a speech 8, 4, 10) ; 30, 29, 6 neutrum cur adfirmem habeo ; 43, 13, 2 quae in meos annales referam ; and 44, 14, 13 ne nunc quidem haec sine indignatione legi audirive posse certum habeo. The large number of occurrences in the first decade indicates that Livy did not have much confidence in his sources, while for the later periods he felt that they were in the main correct, though he sometimes expresses doubt in regard to some statements.

There is also a considerable number of other passages in which Livy refers to himself either directly by a verb in the first person, or by an impersonal verb. The occurrences of the indicative, including those given in the Archiv X. p. 82, are as follows: 3, 4, 1 id admoneo, ne quis . . . putet ; 39, 52, 1 adsentior ; 43, 13, 2 nescio. 2, 2, 2 ; 23, 16, 16 ; 26, 42, 4 ; and 28, 12, 2 nescio an ; 27, 7, 5 haud nescius ; 43, 13, 1 non sum nescius ; 3, 60, 2 haud scio an ; 9, 19, 12 recordor. The plural is also used in a few passages: 10, 31, 10 agimus ; 9, 18 1 loquimur. Sometimes the plural is used by Livy speaking as a Roman citizen: 3, 65, 11 iniungimus ; 7, 25, 9 adeo in quae laboramus sola crevimus, divitias luxuriamque ; 9, 18, 5 ducimus ; 9, 19, 17 vivimus ; and in the perfect 9, 19, 15 laboravimus.

Impersonal statements are used with some freedom: 4, 29, 6 nec libet credere—et licet in variis opinionibus—; 5, 34, 6 nisi de Hercule fabulis credere libet ; also 8, 30, 8 ; and 39, 41, 6 ; 9, 17, 2 ut quaerere libeat ; 1, 28, 11 ; 9, 18, 12 licet ; 9, 18, 4 referre . . . piget ; 10, 18, 7 piget tamen id certum ponere ; 26, 49, 1 piget scribere ; 9, 19, 1 restat ut . . . conparentur ; 3, 47, 5 nudum videtur proponendum ; 6, 20, 5 illud notandum videtur ; 8, 11, 11 illud adiciendum videtur ; 29, 29, 5. An adjective is used with

*est* 4, 16, 4 vix credibile est; 3, 5, 12 difficile ad fidem est, in tam antiqua re . . . exacto adfirmare numero; 8, 40, 3 nec facile est rem rei aut auctorem auctori praeferre; 1, 30, 7; 2, 1, 11; 31, 38, 7 mirum est; cf. 1, 43, 12 nec mirari oportet. There is an occasional instance of the future 22, 54, 8 succumbam oneri neque adgrediar narrare quae edissertando minora vero faciam; 45, 25, 3 haud inseram simulacrum viri copiosi 29, 14, 9; 2, 1, 1 peragam; 38, 12, 1 bellum gessit, quod nunc ordiri pergam. Passive forms occur 6, 1, 3 exponentur; 7, 29, 1 dicentur.

The perfect is used both in the singular and in the plural: 27, 7, 5 contuli; 8, 26, 6 haud ignarus . . . dedi; 36, 6, 1 dixi; 4, 37, 3; 22, 28, 8; 31, 35, 1; and 44, 3, 1 diximus (8, 24, 18 dixisse satis est); 8, 11, 1 duxi; 4, 20, 5; 6, 1, 1; and 10, 26, 5 exposui; 45, 43, 8 auctorem pro re posui; 32, 6, 8 legi; 9, 17, 15 nominavi; 5, 18, 6 and 36, 19, 11 scripsimus; 23, 48, 4 perscripsimus; 33, 10, 10 Polybium auctorem secuti sumus; 39, 48, 6 statui; 9, 44, 3 tradidimus; 23, 6, 8 veritus sum; 38, 56, 3 vidimus; 9, 17, 2 volutavi animum. The pluperfect is used 35, 15, 2 quem missum paulo ante dixeram in Syriam; 35, 40, 2 deverteram. While *dixi* and *dixeram* occur but once each, and *diximus* once in each of the decades, *ante dictum est* (see Fügner Liv. Lex. p. 1188) occurs for the different decades 7-17-12-3, and without *ante* 4, 61, 11 cuius excidium dictum est; and with *supra* 45, 4, 2; and 45, 26, 15.

The subjunctive is likewise used to indicate the attitude of Livy toward his sources or some phase of the subject which he was discussing.

A part are verbs of wishing: 8, 18, 2 illud pervelim . . . proditum falso esse; 21, 46, 10 malim de filio verum esse; 22, 7, 4 praeterquam quod nihil auctum ex vano velim; 29, 25, 2 malim; 38, 55, 8. 9, 17, 7 recenseam; 9, 18, 12 nominem; 9, 15, 10 haud sciam an; 6, 12, 3 auctor sim. Conditional statements occur 5, 21, 9; 26, 22, 14; 26, 49, 3 scripserim si auctorem Graecum sequar Silenum; 27, 27, 12; 39, 48, 6 si expromere velim, immemor sim propositi. A *cum* clause is used 33, 20, 13 non operae est persequi . . . cum ad ea . . . vix sufficiam; and result clauses 38, 56, 1; and 22, 36, 1 adeo variant auctores, ut vix quicquam satis certum adfirmare ausus sim. Parenthetic statements in the subjunctive are found 9, 18, 2 ut ita dicam; 9, 17, 6; 27, 27, 13; and 37, 45, 12 ut omittam; 9, 17, 5 ut ordiar; 9, 17, 14 ne nominem.

The imperfect occurs 9, 17, 1; 9, 30, 5 rem dictu parvam praeterirem, ni ad religionem visa esset pertinere; 29, 14, 9. Livy also

speaks for others 1, 19, 3 using *videremus* in regard to the closing of the temple of Janus. In addition to *scripserim* 26, 49, 3, the perfect subjunctive is found 1, 46, 4 pluribus auctoribus filium ediderim; 8, 18, 3 ne cui auctorum fidem abrogaverim; 22, 23, 3 laeto verius dixerim quam prospero eventu pugnatum fuerat; 22, 36, 1 ausus sim; 23, 16, 15 ausim. The pluperfect occurs 4, 20, 7 *audissem* referring to some information received from Augustus; and 27, 8, 5 libens reticuissem, ni ex mala fama in bonam vertisset.

At times Livy uses the personal pronoun referring to himself, as in 4, 20, 6 titulus ipse spoliis inscriptus illos meque arguit consulem ea Cossum cepisse; 21, 47, 6 potiores apud me auctores sunt; 35, 40, 1 abstulere me . . . Graeciae res inmixtae Romanis. The dative is used in the same way: 6, 12, 2 mihi percensenti; 27, 7, 6 mihi minus simile veri visum est; 41, 25, 8; 43, 13, 2 mihi vestustas res scribenti nescio quo pacto anticus fit animus. The pronoun is omitted 7, 6, 6 cura non deesset; and 41, 25, 8 sustinenti . . . scribere. Livy states his own opinions 29, 14, 9; and 37, 48, 7 quia neminem alium auctorem habeo, neque adfirmata res mea opinione sit nec pro vana praetermissa.

The details of many of the events recorded are given as if they were a part of the current tradition. *Ferunt* and *fertur*, *tradunt* and *traditur*, *dicunt* and *dicitur* are of frequent occurrence. It is probable that the account of some of the events thus apparently referred to tradition had come to Livy by literary transmission, but the use of these indefinite verbs gives a skeptical coloring to many a good old story. The occurrences for the different decades are as follows:

	Decade I.	III.	IV.	V.
<i>dicitur</i>	39	5	7	6
<i>dicuntur</i>	7	7	4	1
<i>fertur</i>	6	6	3	1
<i>ferunt</i>	33	11	4	3
<i>traditur</i>	21	2	2	4
<i>tradunt</i>	3	2	3	3
<i>traduntur</i>	4	1	2	1
<i>memorare</i>	3	...	...	...
<i>prodere</i>	8	4	3	...
<i>credere</i>	3	2	1	...
other verbs	6	...	1	...



	Decade I.	III.	IV.	V.
<i>ambigitur</i>	4	2	I	...
<i>certum est</i>	I	...	...	...
<i>constat</i>	22	6	4	...
<i>convenit</i>	4	3	2	I
<i>discrepat</i> ( <i>haud</i> or <i>nec</i> )	2	I	I	...
Total	166	52	38	20

A few examples will be quoted as illustrations of the entire mass: 25, 24, 11 Marcellus . . . inlacrimasse dicitur. *Dicuntur* is commonly used in giving numbers, as in 1, 44, 2 milia LXXX eo lustro civium censa dicuntur. *Fertur* and *ferunt* are used with the same freedom: 1, 48, 7 Tullia per patris corpus carpentum egisse fertur; 1, 4, 5 Romularem vocatam ferunt; 1, 36, 4 eludens artem, ut ferunt, and also tum illud haud cunctanter discidissem cotem ferunt. *Fertur* is sometimes used to vouch for the genuineness of a speech as in 22, 38, 13; 22, 60, 5; and 28, 43, 1. Forms of *tradere* are used in indefinite references to literary sources: 5, 33, 2 eam gentem traditur . . . Alpes transisse: 4, 12, 7 coepere a fame mala, seu adversus annus frugibus fuit, seu dulcedine contionum . . . nam utrumque traditur. *Traduntur* like *dicuntur* is most commonly used in giving the losses in battle: 8, 30, 7 viginti milia hostium caesa eo die traduntur; 24, 17, 6; 34, 22, 2; 40, 40, 11; 42, 7, 9. *Prodere* is generally found in connection with *memoriae* as in 3, 39, 2; 3, 54, 12; 8, 6, 1; 9, 27, 14; 24, 43, 7; 25, 31, 9; 27, 26, 13; 27, 36, 8; 27, 40, 8; 28, 38, 7; 36, 37, 2; 38, 55, 2; 40, 29, 2. It is also used on the authority of others 38, 50, 3; and 40, 40, 6. Polybius 23, 14, 5 says *φαρμάκῳ διέφθειρεν*, while Livy 39, 34, 10 softens the statement to *veneno creditur sublatus*. Some other verbs indicate matters of common report: 1, 7, 4 Herculem . . . boves mira specie abegisse memorant; 1, 18, 2 auctorem doctrinae eius . . . falso Samium Pythagoram edunt; cf. 40, 29, 8.

The general attitude of the sources is given in many passages, and their agreement or disagreement indicated, chiefly by *ambigitur*, *constat* and *convenit*: 2, 1, 3 neque ambigitur; 8, 40, 2 id ambigitur; 9, 15, 9 id magis mirabile est ambigi; 10, 5, 14 id unum non ambigitur; 21, 38, 6 eo magis miror ambigi; 33, 36, 15 id quoque inter scriptores ambigitur. Livy begins his narrative with *satis constat*, an expression which occurs a dozen times. *Constat* with some other modifier, or unmodified, is used a little

more freely, as in 1, 3, 3 certe natum Aenea constat; 4, 13, 7 nihil enim constat nisi in libros linteos . . . ; and 8, 12, 1 T. Manlius . . . cui venienti seniores tantum obviam exisse constat. *Convenit* is similarly used but less frequently: 2, 50, 11 (Fabios) trecentos sex perisse satis convenit; 44, 42, 7 facile convenit ab Romanis numquam una acie tantum Macedonum interfectum; 26, 49, 6 non de numero navium captarum, non de pondere auri . . . convenit; 30, 16, 12 pecuniae summam quantam imperaverit, parum convenit. Agreement of the sources is also indicated by *discrepat* with a negative in 8, 40, 1; 9, 46, 4; 22, 36, 5; and 38, 56, 5. Speaking of the movements of the Senones, Livy says 5, 35, 3 id parum certum est, cf. 27, 1, 13 quis pro certo adfirmet; and of L. Tarquinius, 1, 46, 4 Prisci Tarquinii regis filius neposne fuerit, parum liquet.

Different degrees of uncertainty are expressed by the use of adjectives. Probability is the result attained 34, 54, 8 adeo nihil motum ex antiquo probabile est; veteribus, nisi quae usus evidenter arguit, stari malunt. Approximate correctness is all that is claimed for a number of statements: 2, 14, 3 proximum vero est ex iis quae traduntur; 2, 41, 11 id propius fidem est; 4, 17, 5; 4, 37, 1; 8, 37, 5; 9, 36, 4; 23, 12, 2; and 40, 50, 7 propius vero est. At other points verisimilitude only is the result of Livy's search: 7, 27, 9; and 21, 38, 4 magis veri simile est; 38, 55, 9 similis enim veri est; 6, 12, 4; 21, 38, 8; 21, 47, 5; 26, 22, 15; and 27, 7, 6 simile veri; 8, 26, 6; and 10, 26, 13 similis vero; 23, 19, 17 id verius est. Doubt is expressed 23, 47, 8 quam vera est, communis existimatio est; cf. 4, 20, 8 qui si ea in re sit error existimatio communis omnibus est.

#### FABULA. FAMA.

Livy candidly admits at times that he allowed fables and common reports a place in his work. These may be considered as standing between those statements which are expressed by verbs, and those in which a person, definitely or indefinitely indicated, is given as authority for the account given.

*Fabula.*—The value which he attached to the fables is shown by Praef. 6 quae ante conditam condendamve urbem poeticis magis decora fabulis quam incorruptis rerum gestarum monumentis traduntur, ea nec adfirmare nec refellere in animo est. Some, however, were due, not to poetic embellishment, but to family pride: 8, 40, 4 vitiata memoria funebribus laudibus

reor falsisque imaginum titulis, dum familiae ad se quaeque famam rerum gestarum honorumque fallenti mendacio trahunt. The number mentioned by Livy is not large: of Romulus and the she-wolf he says 1, 4, 7 inde locum fabulae ac miraculo; in the story of Tarpeia 1, 11, 8 additur fabulae; the seizing of the offering at Veii by Roman soldiers is characterized 5, 21, 8 inseritur huic loco fabula; and a little later, 5, 22, 5, he adds inde fabulae adiectum est vocem dicentis (Iunonis) velle auditam; explaining the origin of the name of lacus Curtius he says 7, 6, 6 et lacus nomen ab hac recentiore insignitius fabula est; and in writing about Scipio 38, 56, 8 alia tota serenda fabula est Gracchi orationi conveniens, et illi auctores sequendi sunt qui . . . tradunt.

*Fama.*—*Fama* as a source of information is used more freely, for the different decades 9-13-4-0, and in some instances refers to statements derived from a definite source, e. g. 1, 1, 6 duplex inde fama est: alii . . . tradunt, alii . . .; 8, 20, 6; 29, 21, 1; 25, 17, 4 varia est fama, alii . . . alii . . . tradunt. Livy uses the word a few times in writing of the marvelous and improbable, e. g. 1, 49, 9 si famae credimus, ab Ulixee deaque Circa oriundus; and 24, 3, 7 fama est aram esse in vestibulo templi, cuius cinerem nullus umquam moveat ventus. However, in most passages, it is used with the same meaning as in 7, 6, 6 nunc fama rerum standum est, ubi certam derogat vetustas fidem.

#### MEMORIA.

*Memoria* is used a little oftener than *fama*, 13-4-4-1, most frequently with *prodere* or *tradere*, and like *fama* of both definite and apparently indefinite reports. Its definite meaning can be seen in such passages as 10, 37, 13 et huius anni parum constans memoria est . . . auctor est Claudius . . . Fabius . . . scribit; 39, 50, 10 a quibusdam memoriae mandatum; 39, 52, 2 quam notam nemo memoriae prodidit. In most passages the word may refer to statements from the annals though there is no indication of the fact, e. g. 8, 6, 1 proditur memoriae . . . vocem Anni spernentis numina Iovis Romani auditam; 10, 42, 6 illud memoriae traditur, non ferme alium ducem laetiozem in acie visum seu suopte ingenio seu fiducia gerundae rei.

#### ANNALES.

Livy refers to his own work 43, 13, 2 as meos annales; to Piso 10, 9, 12 as vetustior annalium auctor; and to Claudius 25, 39, 12 qui annales Acilianos ex Graeco in Latinum sermonem vertit.

The word is used in a few passages referring to historical compositions in general: 7, 21, 6 *meriti aequitate curaue sunt, ut per omnium annalium monumenta celebres nominibus essent*; 8, 18, 12 *memoria ex annalibus repetita*; 9, 18, 12 *paginas in annalibus fastisque magistratuum percurrere licet*; 9, 44, 4 *in annalibus digerendis*; 43, 13, 1 *in annales referri*; 22, 27, 3 (in a speech) *quod nulla memoria habeat annalium*. The other occurrences of the word, 20-4-1-1, refer to the writings consulted by Livy. Of these, thirteen have some form of *invenire*, most commonly in *quibusdam annalibus invenio*. In the remaining passages the word is modified, showing the uncertainty in which Livy was involved. *Quidam annales* is found 4, 20, 9; 4, 34, 6; 8, 30, 7; 8, 37, 3; 10, 17, 11; 21, 25, 4; 23, 47, 8. Other occurrences are as follows: 4, 20, 8 *tam veteres a.*; 7, 42, 3 *alii a. proditum est*; 10, 30, 7 *in pluribus a.*; 22, 31, 8 *omnium prope a.*; 32, 6, 8 *ceteri Graeci Latinique auctores quorum quidem ego legi a.*; 42, 11, 1 *plurium a., et quibus credidisse malis*.

#### AUCTOR.

*Auctor* and *auctores*, without the name of a writer, are freely used by Livy, and generally refer to some source not otherwise designated. With the plural, always modified, *apud* is used five times, and twice with *neminem auctorem*. Most of the eight passages in which *inter* is used with *auctores* recount discrepancies in statement. *Quidam* is used with *auctor* eighteen times, *habere* four (also 8, 4, 10 in a speech), and in four more places we are told that authors disagree. Livy gives a statement 4, 20, 5 as found in all the authorities, and then argues against their conclusions. Uncertainty arises 4, 55, 8; and 30, 26, 12 from *diversi auctores*, while *nec* or *non omnes* is used 8, 6, 3; 8, 18, 2; and 29, 35, 2. *Alii . . . alii auctores* occurs 8, 20, 6. Livy follows many authors 1, 46, 4 and 6, 42, 6; and in 21, 46, 10 the majority. *Auctores sunt qui* or *qui sunt auctores* is used six times, while it is said 8, 26, 6 *cum auctoribus hoc dedi, quibus dignius credi est*. *Graeci Latinique auctores* is used 29, 27, 13; and 32, 6, 8. In the remaining passages, the word is found in a variety of connections: 3, 47, 5 *antiqui*; 6, 12, 2 *propiores*; 8, 40, 5 *nec . . . certo a. stetur*; 10, 25, 12 *in utrumque auctores sunt*; 21, 47, 6 *potiores apud me*; 30, 3, 6 *maior pars*; and in other general statements 2, 17, 3; 2, 21, 4; 8, 18, 3; 8, 40, 3; 38, 56, 8. The method of reference in the 72 passages where *auctor* is used, 37-27-7-1, is

the same as with *annales*, when the current runs smoothly nothing is said as to the sources, but when there is a divergence of opinions, Livy frankly calls attention to the fact.

#### SCRIPTORES.

*Scriptores* is found in but few places, and the reading for all passages cannot be definitely determined. The usage is about the same as with *auctor*. It is found with *apud* 3, 23, 7 a. vetustiores; and 8, 30, 7 a. antiquissimos; with *inter* 9, 18, 5; 26, 11, 10; 33, 36, 15; and 38, 56, 5. It is used in connection with *auctor* 8, 40, 5; with *proximi* 29, 14, 9; and in contrast with a definite writer in 23, 6, 8; 26, 49, 5 Arinen . . . Antias Valerius, Magonem alii s. tradunt; and 45, 44, 19 haec de Prusia nostri scriptores; Polybius . . . tradit. Speaking of the renown of Philopoemen, Livy says 39, 50, 10 ab s. rerum Graecis Latinisque tantum huic viro tribuitur, ut a quibusdam . . . Cf. 8, 10, 8 ut facile convenerit inter Romanos Latinosque, qui eius pugnae memoriam posteris tradiderunt. In a general reference 1, 59, 11 his atrocioribusque, credo aliis, quae praesens rerum indignitas haudquaquam relatu scriptoribus facilia subicit, memoratis . . . perpulit.

#### ALII. QUIDAM. SUNT QUI. PLERIQUE.

Statements in which a pronoun alone indicates the authorship occur with considerable frequency. *Alii* (10-8-4-1), *quidam* (13-8-1-1), *sunt qui* (13-3-1-0) and *plerique* (0-3-1-0) are used in the same way. Compare 4, 21, 9 alii, alii . . . tradunt, with 8, 20, 6 alii . . . alii auctores; and 7, 22, 3 quidam Caesonem, alii Gaium nomen Quinctio adiciunt, and 9, 36, 2 eum Fabium Caesonem alii, C. Claudium quidam . . . tradunt; or 10, 17, 12 sunt qui . . . faciant . . . quidam. *Apud* is used with *alios* and *quosdam* as with *auctores* and *scriptores*, though the occurrences of the nominative of these pronouns are more numerous. A number of verbs are employed, as *dicunt*, *scribunt* and *tradunt*, with an occasional instance of some others, e. g. 4, 17, 3 levant quidam regis facinus; 29, 25, 3 quidam non adiecere numerum. *Sunt qui* is at times a variant with *alii* or *quidam*, e. g. 25, 17, 1-4 sunt qui . . . contendant . . . sunt qui . . . scribant . . . alii . . . alii . . . tradunt.

There are also a few other references expressed in different ways: 6, 12, 3 ab antiquis tacitum praetermissumque; 9, 28, 5 qui . . . trahunt, adiciunt, cf. 25, 11, 20 in diversum auctores

trahunt; 10, 11, 9 ut scripsere quibus aedilem fuisse in eo anno Fabium Maximum placet; 38, 56, 1 multa alia . . . in diversum trahunt; 40, 50, 6 L. Postumium . . . egregie pugnasse scribunt. Without mentioning the name, Livy gives in 9, 17, 14 the statement of Cineas, senatus ille, quem qui ex regibus constare dixit unus veram speciem Romani senatus cepit! And alludes to some unnamed Greeks 9, 18, 6 id vero periculum erat, quod levissimi ex Graecis, qui Parthorum quoque contra nomen Romanum gloriae favent, dictitare solent, ne maiestatem nominis Alexandri . . . sustinere non potuerit populus Romanus! Notice also 9, 17, 6 Cyrum, quem maxime Graeci laudibus celebrant.

#### ALIBI . . . ALIBI.

As a rhetorical variation for the pronominal form of statement *alibi* . . . *alibi* is used a few times with *invenire* in the third decade: 26, 49, 1 piget scribere, quippe cum a. trecentos ferme, a. tria milia septingentos viginti quattuor fuisse inveniam; 26, 49, 2; 27, 1, 13; 29, 25, 2 inter auctores discrepat, a. . . . a. . . . a. . . . invenio . . . quidam . . . Coelius; 30, 16, 12 a. quinque milia talentum, a. quinque milia pondo argenti, a. duplex stipendium militibus imperatum invenio.

#### AUTHORS.

The passages in which Livy mentions by name the earlier annalists whose works he utilized are to be found in Peter's *Historicorum Romanorum Fragmenta*, and will not be repeated excepting so far as it is necessary to call attention to their general character. As a matter of convenience we shall give them in the order in which they are found in Peter.

*Fabius*.—Fabius was rated high by Livy, yet all the references are to isolated facts: 1, 44, 2 the number of Romans at the first census; 1, 55, 8 the number of talents used in building the temple to Jove; 2, 40, 10 the old age of Coriolanus; 8, 30, 9 the reason for burning the Samnite booty captured by Q. Fabius; 10, 37, 14 the movements of the consuls in the Samnite campaign; 22, 7, 4 the loss at Trasumene. These citations, limited in number and referring to specific facts, throw no light on the question of the extent to which his work was utilized by Livy in the portions where Fabius is not mentioned.

*L. Cincius Alimentus*.—There is but one mention of this writer and that by no means complimentary 21, 38, 2 quantae

copiae transgresso in Italiam Hannibali fuerint, nequaquam inter auctores constat . . . L. Cincius Alimentus, qui captum se ab Hannibale scribit, maxime *me* auctor moveret, nisi confunderet numerum Gallis Liguribusque additis: cum his octoginta milia peditum, decem equitum adducta (in Italia magis adfluxisse veri simile est, et ita quidam auctores sunt); ex ipso autem audisse Hannibale, postquam Rhodanum transierit, triginta sex milia hominum ingentem numerum equorum et aliorum iumentorum amisisse.

*C. Acilius*.—Livy refers 25, 39, 12 to the *annales Aciliani* as the source of one of three accounts of a fight in Spain; and 35, 14, 5 for the conversation at Ephesus between Hannibal and Scipio. From some source, perhaps from these annals, perhaps from Cicero, Livy had read of the ambassadors from Cannae returning to camp, a story of which he says 22, 61, 10 *mirari magis adeo discrepare inter auctores, quam quid veri sit, discernere queas*.

*Cato*.—Livy expressed high regard for the personal character of Cato 39, 40, 3, and Servius ad Verg. Aen. more than once cites both as coordinate authorities for events in early Roman history. For historical information Livy refers to him but once, and that in a colorless statement, 34, 15, 9 Cato ipse, *haud sane detractator laudum suarum, multos caesos ait, numerum non adscribit*. Cf. 38, 54, 11 *exstat oratio eius de pecunia regis Antiochi*.

*L. Calpurnius Piso Censorius Frugi*.—A high value is not put upon the work of Piso in the six passages in which he is mentioned by Livy: 9, 44, 2 there is a brief discussion of his omission of two pairs of consuls; 1, 55, 7 Fabius is preferred; 2, 58, 1 another source is followed; and 2, 32, 3 a more common report is taken. In 25, 39, 12–15 Piso's is one of three accounts given without comment; and 10, 9, 12 a statement made by Macer Licinius and Tubero is not given *pro certo* because of the account in Piso.

*L. Coelius Antipater*.—Surprise is expressed 21, 38, 6 at what Coelius says of Hannibal's route across the Alps; 21, 46, 10 another account is preferred of the saving of Scipio at the Ticinus; and 21, 47, 4 there is an argument against the account of Hannibal's passage of the Po. A similar rejection of statement is found 22, 31, 8; while 29, 25, 3 there is an implied criticism of the number given of the troops said to have been taken by Scipio into Africa;

and 29, 27, 14 Livy does not believe there was a storm as described by Coelius, but says *prosperam navigationem sine terrore ac tumultu fuisse permultis Graecis Latinisque auctoribus credidi*. A variant account is likewise given 26, 11, 10 of Hannibal's route to Rome. Coelius is also mentioned in connection with other writers: 28, 46, 14 different accounts of the same event are given from Valerius and from Coelius, while the two are given 29, 35, 2 as coordinate authorities. From the form of statement it would seem that more than these are referred to 23, 6, 8 *quia . . . Coelius et alii id haud sine causa praetermiserant scriptores, ponere pro certo veritus sum*. The carefulness of Coelius is indicated 27, 27, 13 where Livy mentions three accounts given of the death of Marcellus, but there is nowhere an indication of his general indebtedness to Coelius.

*P. Rutilius Rufus*.—Reference is made but once to this writer 39, 52, 1 where, with Polybius, he is cited as authority for the date of Scipio's death.

*Q. Claudius Quadrigarius*.—Livy gives 6, 42, 5, but without accepting it, the year in which the Gaul was slain by T. Manlius; 9, 5, 2 the view of Claudius in regard to the agreement at the Caudine Forks is rejected; and 33, 10, 17 is given the number killed at Cynoscephalae, and then the number given by Claudius is added. Claudius (*Aciliani annales*) is mentioned 25, 39, 12, together with Valerius and Piso, for losses in battle, and the first two again 33, 10, 8; 33, 30, 8; and 38, 23, 8; and 10, 37, 13 Claudius and Fabius. In 8, 19, 13; 33, 36, 13; 38, 41, 12; and 44, 15, 1 separate items are mentioned from Claudius, and 35, 14, 5 from the *Aciliani libri*.

*Valerius Antias*.—The writer most frequently mentioned, and the one most severely criticised is Valerius Antias. Livy more than once scores his audacity or mendacity: 3, 5, 13 *audet tamen Antias Valerius concipere summas*; 26, 49, 3 *nullus mentiendi modus est*; 30, 19, 11; 33, 10, 8; 36, 38, 7 *in augendo eo non alius intemperantior est*; 40, 29, 8 *adicit Antias Valerius Pythagoricos fuisse . . . vulgatae opinioni . . . mendacio probabili accommodata fide*. In contrast with these statements, as if surprised at the modesty shown, Livy says 38, 23, 8 that Antias gives the loss at 10,000, while Claudius puts it at 40,000. Some charity is shown for him 38, 55, 8 *has ego summas auri et argenti relatas apud Antiatem inveni*. In L. Scipione *malim equidem librarii mendum quam mendacium scriptoris esse in summa auri atque argenti*.



If Livy's references are a fair index to the work of Antias it must have swarmed with errors both in facts and figures. Livy rejects 30, 3, 6 the account of the negotiations with Syphax; 30, 29, 7 of the battle before that at Zama; 32, 6, 5 of the operations of Villius; 36, 19, 12 of the loss in the army of Antiochus; 37, 48, 1 and 6 of the capture of the Roman leaders in Asia; 39, 52, 1 of the date of Scipio's death; 39, 41, 6 of the number of poisoners executed; 39, 43, 1 of the story of Flaminius and the harlot; 42, 11, 1 of the conduct of Attalus, and 44, 13, 12 of Eumenes; 45, 40, 1 of the amount of gold and silver in the triumph over Perseus; and 45, 43, 8 of the amount brought back from Illyria by Anicius.

Without attempting to make the proper corrections, Livy places the account of Antias along with that of other annalists in 4, 23, 2 names of consuls; 25, 39, 14 and 34, 15, 9 loss in battle; 28, 46, 14 movements of Carthaginian ships; 29, 35, 2 capture of Hanno; and 33, 30, 8 terms of treaty.

In the fourth and fifth decades the following references are made to isolated facts gathered from the work of Antias and presented without comment: 33, 30, 10 stipulation in a treaty; 33, 36, 13 and 34, 10, 2 loss in battle; 35, 2, 8 voyage of C. Flaminius; 36, 36, 4 first scenic games; 37, 60, 6 return of captives; 38, 50, 5 the accusers of Scipio; 39, 22, 9 Scipio as legate to Asia; 39, 56, 7 date of Hannibal's death; 41, 27, 2 L. Furius as colleague of L. Cornelius Scipio.

*Macer*.—The authority of Macer is questioned 7, 9, 5 *quaesita ea propriae familiae laus leviolem auctorem Licinium facit*. 4, 7, 12 he is quoted for the names of the consuls 310 B. C.; 4, 20, 8 for the official position of Cossus; and 9, 38, 16 for the abomination of the *Faucia curia*. In 10, 9, 10 he is mentioned with Tubero: 4, 23, 1 with Antias; and 9, 46, 3 with Piso.

*Q. Aelius Tubero*.—Livy always associates the name of Tubero with that of another annalist: 10, 9, 10 with Macer; and 4, 23, 2 with Macer and Antias.

*C. Clodius Licinus*.—From Licinus Livy obtained 29, 22, 10 the story of the conspiracy of Pleminius, which, without reference to the source, is again given 34, 44, 7.

*Cincius*.—Livy has an item 7, 3, 7 in regard to the nails in the temple of Nortia the Etruscan goddess, and this is referred to Cincius "*diligens talium monumentorum auctor*."

The following table gives the number of references, arranged according to decades, to the different authors:

	Decade I.	III.	IV.	V.
Antias	2	7	22	5
Claudius	4	I	6	I
Cincius	I	...	...	...
Fabius	5	I	...	...
Macer	7	...	...	...
Piso	5	I	...	...
Tubero	2	...	...	...
(Acilius)	...	I	I	...
Alimentus	...	I	...	...
Clodius Licinus	...	I	...	...
Coelius	...	II	...	...
Cato	...	...	I	...
Rutilius	...	...	I	...
Polybius	...	I	3	I

Livy frequently gives to his narrative a present coloring by comparing past conditions with those existing at his own time. This method of presentation gives him an opportunity to record his own observations, and tends to unify the past and the present in the narrative. *Hodie* and *nunc* are used in these comparisons, and *nuper* also referring to a period a little removed from Livy. Of these terms *hodie* is rare, while *nunc* is freely used.

#### HODIE.

*Hodie quoque* is found in the following passages: 1, 17, 9 *hodie quoque* in legibus magistratibusque rogandis usurpatur idem ius vi adempta; 1, 26, 13 *id hodie quoque publice semper refectum manet*; 5, 27, 1 *quod hodie quoque in Graecia manet*. *Hodie quoque* is also found in speeches 24, 8, 18; and 40, 12, 11 referring to the time of the speaker as does *hodieque* 5, 4, 14; and 42, 34, 2.

#### NUNC.

In all the passages here considered, *nunc* refers to conditions existing at the time of Livy. It is used in speaking of Livy's own work as in 7, 6, 6 *nunc fama rerum standum est*; and 10, 31, 10 *supersunt etiam nunc Samnitium bella*. Some of the statements, we know not how many, are true also for the source followed, and may have been directly copied by Livy. Compare 40, 3, 3 in *Emathiam quae nunc dicitur, quondam adpellata Paeonia est*, with Polybius 24, 8, 4 *εἰς τὴν νῦν μὲν Ἠμαθίαν, τὸ δὲ παλαιὸν Παιονίαν*

προσαγορευομένην. Cf. 33, 17, 5 Leucadia nunc insula est . . . tum paeninsula erat. Others are certainly due to Livy himself, giving his views in regard to the prevailing social and religious conditions of the times, or referring to changes taking place later than the time of the annalists to whom Livy may have been indebted for the general facts stated.

*Appellative and Geographical.*—To Livy himself perhaps may be assigned the remarks in regard to changes in names of places, and the location of places in and about Rome. The old and the new name of a place is sometimes given: 1, 3, 5 Albula: Tiberis; 1, 4, 5 Romularis: Ruminalis; 4, 37, 1 Vulturnus: Capua; 4, 59, 4 Anxur: Tarracinae; 8, 15, 4 Suessa: Aurunca; 9, 27, 14 Maleventum: Beneventum. Livy describes the position of the Asylum 1, 8, 5 locum, qui nunc saeptus descendentibus inter duos lucos est, but this must not be taken as a type of his method of locating places which is usually quite definite: 1, 3, 9 in eo colle qui nunc pars Romanae est urbis; 2, 7, 12 ubi nunc Vicae Potae est, domus . . . aedificata; 3, 26, 8 trans Tiberim, contra eum ipsum locum, ubi nunc Navaliam sunt; 3, 63, 7 in prata Flaminia, ubi nunc aedes Apollinis est; 5, 32, 6 in nova via ubi nunc sacellum est supra aedem Vestae; 5, 35, 1 ubi nunc Brixia ac Verona urbes sunt; 6, 20, 13 cum domus fuisset ubi nunc aedes atque officium Monetae est; 8, 22, 5 Palaepolis fuit haud procul inde, ubi nunc Neapolis sita est; 10, 9, 8 locus . . . ubi nunc Narnia sita est; 25, 20, 1 ad Volturini ostium, ubi nunc urbs est, castellum; 32, 7, 3 Castrum portorium quo in loco nunc oppidum est; 39, 22, 6 haud procul inde, ubi nunc Aquilia est; 39, 45, 6 in agro qui nunc est Aquileiensis. In other places attention is called to the names applied at the time of Livy: 1, 17, 6 nunc quoque tenet nomen, interregnum appellatum; 1, 26, 10 eo loco qui nunc Pila Horatia appellatur; 1, 35, 8 tunc primum circo, qui nunc maximus dicitur; 1, 36, 7 quas nunc, quia geminatae sunt, sex vocant centurias; 3, 48, 5 tabernae quibus nunc novis est nomen; 26, 27, 2 argentariae quae nunc novae appellantur; 3, 54, 15 in pratis Flaminiiis . . . quem nunc circum Flaminium appellant; 7, 5, 9 nam antea, sicut nunc, quos Rufulos vocant, imperatores ipsi faciebant; 7, 39, 16 viae quae nunc Appia est.

*Religious.*—The religious element in Roman society is made prominent by Livy and different phases are presented in several places: 1, 20, 1 sacra . . . quae nunc ad dialem flaminem pertinent; 1, 32, 5 ius . . . quod nunc fetiales habent; 22, 57, 3 scriba

pontificius, quos nunc minores pontifices appellant; 5, 40, 8 sacello proximo aedibus . . . ubi despui religio est. The earlier, better days are mentioned 4, 6, 12 hanc modestiam, aequitatem et altitudinem animi ubi nunc in uno inveneris, quae tum populi universi fuit; and 10, 9, 6 id, qui tum pudor hominum erat, visum, credo, vinculum satis validum legis. nunc vix servo ita minetur quisquam. 26, 22, 14 eludant nunc antiqua mirantis; non equidem, si qua sit sapientium civitas, quam docti fingunt magis quam norunt, aut principes graviiores temperantioresque a cupidine imperii aut multitudinem melius moratam censeam fieri posse; cf. in a speech 6, 41, 8 eludant nunc licet religiones. As an indication of early religious scruples, in 9, 30, 10 is mentioned the rewards given to the extradited pipers: datum ut triduum quotannis ornati cum cantu atque hac, quae nunc sollemnis est, licentia per urbem vagarentur. Contrasted with these early conditions is the later degeneracy: 3, 20, 5 sed nondum haec, quae nunc tenet saeculum, neglegentia deum venerat; 43, 13, 1 non sum nescius ab eadem neglegentia, qua nihil deos portendere vulgo nunc credant, neque nuntiari admodum ulla prodigia in publicum neque in annales referri; and 45, 28, 3 templo . . . nunc vestigiis revolsorum donorum, tum donis dives erat.

*Political.*—Political conditions come in for their due share of mention: an institutional change is mentioned 1, 43, 12 nec mirari oportet hunc ordinem, qui nunc est post expletas quinque et triginta tribus . . . ad institutam ab Servio Tullo summam non convenire. The cooling down of political passions is portrayed 4, 45, 13 parva nunc res et vix serio agenda videri possit, quae tunc ingenti certamine patres ac plebem accendit; cf. 44, 14, 13. The importance of the Laws of the Ten Tables is stated 3, 34, 6 quae nunc quoque in hoc immenso aliarum super alias acervatarum legum cumulo fons omnis publici privatique est iuris. As a reward for the friendliness of some of the provinces offering aid to the Romans in 209 B. C., Livy 27, 10, 7 gives their names with the remark, ne nunc quidem post tot saecula sileantur fraudulenturve laude sua. Speaking of the inhabitants of Emporia 34, 9, 1 Livy mentions the Greeks and Spaniards, and then adds, tertium genus Romani coloni ab divo Caesare post devictos Pompei liberos adiecti. nunc in corpus unum confusi omnes Hispanis prius, postremo et Graecis in civitatem Romanam adscitis. The political conditions in Sardinia are described 40,

34, 13 cum Iliensibus, gente ne nunc quidem omni parte pacata, secunda proelia facta. This statement is practically the same as that of Diod. Sic. 5, 15 τὸ δ' ἄλλο πλῆθος διεφύλαξε τὴν ἐλευθερίαν μέχρι τῶν καθ' ἡμῶς χρόνων. Here also may be placed 28, 37, 6 referring to the Balaerians, fundis, ut nunc plurimum, ita tum solo eo telo utebantur.

The decline of the population in Italy is commented on in two passages: 6, 12, 4 simile veri est aut intervallis bellorum, sicut nunc in delectibus fit Romanis, alia atque alia subole iuniorum ad bella instauranda totiens usos esse; aut . . . aut innumerabilem multitudinem liberorum capitum in eis fuisse locis, quae nunc vix seminario exiguo militum relicto servitia Romana ab solitudine vindicant; and 7, 25, 8 decem legiones scriptae dicuntur . . . quem nunc novum exercitum, si qua externa vis ingruat, hae vires populi Romani, quas vix terrarum capit orbis, contractae in unum haud facile efficiant.

There are a few other observations, some of which refer to local conditions at Rome. In the discussion of the pomerium 1, 44, 4 aedificia . . . quae nunc vulgo etiam coniungunt. An anomalous feature at Rome is accounted for 5, 55, 5 ea est causa, ut veteres cloacae, primo per publicum ductae, nunc privata passim subeant tecta, formaque urbis occupatae magis quam divisae similis. The account of a fight is criticised 4, 34, 6 classi quoque ad Fidenas pugnatum cum Veientibus quidam in annales rettulere, rem aequae difficilem atque incredibilem nec nunc lato satis ad hoc amne, et tum aliquanto, ut a veteribus accepimus, artiore. A remark of the annalist is illustrated by a reference to similar conditions 9, 36, 3 habeo auctores vulgo tum Romanos pueros, sicut nunc Graecis, ita Etruscis litteris erudiri solitos. An improvement in the Latin language is indicated 27, 37, 13 carmen in Iunonem Reginam canentes ibant, illa tempestate forsitan laudabile rudibus ingeniis, nunc abhorrens et inconditum, si referatur.

The present time is sometimes indicated by a noun, by a demonstrative pronoun, or by a verb in the present tense.

*Aetas* and *saeculum* with some modifying word are used to fix the time of certain events, and *usque ad aetatem* or *memoriam* to fix the nearer terminus. 7, 14, 6 imperatores, nostra quoque quidam aetate usi sunt; 28, 12, 12 prima Romanis inita provinciarum . . . postremo omnium, nostra demum aetate, ductu auspicioque Augusti Caesaris perdomita est. 26, 22, 15 vix ut verisimile sit, parentium quoque hoc saeculo vilis levisque apud liberos

auctoritas fecit; 39, 22, 2 prope huius saeculi copia. 2, 14, 1 mos, traditus ab antiquis, usque ad nostram aetatem inter cetera sollemnia manet, bona Porsinae vendendi; cf. 1, 30, 2 curiam fecit, quae Hostilia usque ad patrum nostrorum aetatem appellata est; 34, 51, 5 a principio ad nostram usque aetatem traducentis. 2, 41, 3 tum primum lex agraria promulgata est, numquam deinde usque ad hanc memoriam sine maximis motibus rerum agitata; 6, 38, 13 usque ad memoriam nostram . . . certatum viribus est.

Forms of the pronoun *hic* are at times used to indicate conditions that were present to Livy: Praef. 4 festinantibus ad haec nova quibus iam pridem praevalentis populi vires se ipsae conficiant; 1, 56, 2 quibus duobus operibus vix nova haec magnificentia quicquam adaequare potuit; 6, 4, 12 Capitolium . . . opus vel in hac magnificentia urbis conspiciendum; 7, 29, 2 quotiens in extrema periculorum ventum, ut in hanc magnitudinem quae vix sustinetur, erigi imperium posset! Less flattering than these are the following: 7, 2, 13 ludorum quoque prima origo ponenda visa est, ut appareret quam ab sano initio res in hanc vix opulentis regnis tolerabilem insaniam venerit; and 44, 9, 4 mos erat tum, nondum hac effusione inducta bestiis omnium gentium circum complendi, varia spectaculorum conquirere genera.

Livy mentions some places at Rome in the present tense 2, 41, 11 ea est area ante Telluris aedem; 10, 31, 9 aedem quae prope circum est; 23, 31, 9 utraque in Capitolio est, canali uno discretae. Verbs of naming are given about 130 times in the present tense, as 1, 26, 14 sororium tigillum vocant; 1, 48, 7 monumento locus est: Sceleratum vicum vocant; 3, 26, 8 prata Quinctia vocantur; 8, 30, 4 ita vocant locum; 25, 16, 25 ad campos, qui Veteres vocantur, periit; 30, 8, 3 in Magnos—ita vocant—campos; 38, 15, 14 ad Beudos, quod vetus appellant, pervenit; (30, 10, 16 harpagones vocant). It is stated 1, 25, 14 that the sepulchres of the Horatii and Curiatii were still extant, as were the names of those who subscribed to the agreement at the Caudine Forks 9, 5, 4. The boldness of the Athenian orators is indicated 9, 18, 7 id quod ex monumentis orationum patet; orations of Cato are mentioned 39, 42, 6, and 45, 25, 3; and doubt is expressed in regard to the authenticity of others 38, 56, 5 orationes si modo ipsorum sunt quae feruntur.

A few miscellaneous quotations will be given in which Livy states a fact or a reflection in the present: 36, 15, 6 id iugum, sicut Appennini dorso Italia dividitur, ita mediam Graeciam divi-

dit; 31, 44, 3 nec umquam ibi desunt linguae promptae ad plebem concitandam; quod genus, cum in omnibus liberis civitatibus, tum praecipue Athenis, ubi oratio plurimum pollet, favore multitudinis alitur; 31, 44, 9 Athenienses quidem litteris verbisque, quibus solis valent; 1, 9, 16 accedebant blanditiae . . . quae maxime ad muliebre ingenium efficaces sunt; 27, 44, 1 apparebat, quo nihil iniquius est, ex eventu famam habiturum; 22, 39, 10 (in a speech) eventus . . . stultorum iste magister est. Compare with these 2, 30, 2 rerum privatarum, quae semper offecere officientque publicis consiliis.

#### NUPER.

*Nuper* is used in the Praef. 12, and three times in the history referring to events closely connected with the present: 1, 48, 6 ad summum Cyprium vicum ubi Dianium nuper fuit. The removal of this is mentioned by Cicero, de Harusp. resp. 32. 9, 36, 1 silva erat Ciminia magis tum invia atque horrenda quam nuper fuere Germanici saltus. An experience of Livy's is mentioned 38, 56, 3 statua quam tempestate disiectam nuper vidimus ipsi. A recent career is incidentally mentioned 9, 17, 6 sicut Magnum modo Pompeium.

#### TUM. TUNC.

*Tum* and *tunc* are of common occurrence and generally refer to events which, from their nature could not be continued till the time of Livy. But in many passages they are used to contrast past and present conditions, or to emphasize the time at which something new was introduced. In some passages, already quoted, the two periods are formally contrasted by the use of *tum* . . . *nunc*. It cannot always be determined whether *tum* in any specified passage is due to Livy or to the source followed, but this at least is sure, that Livy, when he wrote, had in mind the changes which had taken place among the Roman people, and that he did not view Roman history with the eyes of a mere analyst. While this is true, it is a matter of interpretation whether contrast is implied in particular instances, and the following examples are intended only as a general illustration of the method of Livy. The divisions will correspond in the main to those already given under *nunc*.

*Appellative*.—3, 4, 11 dare Quinctio subitarios milites—ita tum repentina auxilia appellabant—iussi; 3, 52, 3 via Nomentana cui tum Ficulensi nomen fuit; 3, 63, 7 ubi nunc aedes Apollinis

est—iam tum Apollinarem appellabant; and similarly 10, 25, 11 ad Clusium quod Camars olim appellabant.

*Geographical.*—Attention is called 1, 4, 6 to the wilderness where Romulus and Remus were exposed; 9, 36, 1 to the wilderness of the Silva Ciminia; 21, 25, 9 to the forest near Mutina; 21, 38, 8 to the lack of roads over the Alps; 33, 17, 5 to Leucadia as a peninsula; 43, 21, 3 obsides . . . Dyrrhachium—tum Epidamni magis celebre nomen Graecis erat—missi; 43, 21, 6 Stratus validissima tum urbs Aetoliae erat.

*National.*—Statements in regard to national conditions and movements are occasionally found, though in some there may not be an intended contrast with the present. 1, 1, 5 the Aborigines in Italy; 4, 44, 12 the Greeks at Cumae; 5, 8, 4 Veii as the center of Roman interest; 5, 35, 3 the Senones in northern Italy; 5, 33, 2 wine a new indulgence for the Gauls, and 33, 21, 3 their presence in Asia; 23, 10, 11 the government of Cyrene; 28, 37, 4 the Carthaginian control of Pityusa; 33, 26, 6 the independent Spanish uprising; 37, 47, 4 the Romans pitching camp for the first time in Asia; 38, 32, 9 the influence of the Achaeans with the Romans; and 4, 29, 8 the disregard by the Romans of the Carthaginians in Sicily. Notice also the statement without *tum* 34, 50, 7 adice nunc, pro portione, quot verisimile sit Graeciam totam habuisse.

*Political.*—The election of new officers is duly mentioned though they are more frequently designated by *primus*, or the time is emphasized by *tum primum*: 2, 58, 1 tum primum tributis comitiis creati tribuni sunt: cf. 3, 54, 12 quem primum tribunum plebis creatum in Sacro monte proditum memoriae est; 4, 54, 3 the first plebeian quaestors; 23, 31, 13 the first election of two plebeian consuls; and 29, 38, 7 augur . . . admodum adulescens, quod tum perrarum in mandandis sacerdotiis erat. Other references are to varied political actions: 2, 41, 3 the first agrarian law; 3, 63, 11 a triumph ordered by the people; 4, 8, 6 circumstances affecting the actions of the tribunes—id quod tunc erat; 7, 15, 12 the first putting of a bribery question to the people; 3, 36, 3 and 31, 5, 2 the Ides of March as inauguration day; 31, 15, 6 the mention of a new tribe—quam Attalida appellarent; 38, 36, 9 the first enrollment of certain tribes; 40, 16, 4 two provinces as one.

*Military.*—The following refer to military measures: 2, 6, 8 leaders engaging in single combat; 5, 7, 13 a new form of



military service by the knights—*equo merere*; 22, 38, 1 the military oath; 24, 11, 9 the equipment of a fleet by private means; 27, 10, 9 the government upheld by the colonies; 31, 36, 4 the use of elephants; 33, 7, 13 the best cavalry in Greece; 44, 23, 6 the naval glory of the Rhodians.

*Religious.*—Changes in religious conditions are at times mentioned: 1, 5, 1 the existence of the Lupercal in early times; 1, 7, 12 the first sacrifice to Hercules with the Potitii and the Pinarii, then famous families, as guests; 1, 45, 2 the fane of Diana; 5, 13, 6 the first lectisternium; 7, 2, 8 Livius as actor of his own songs, as were all writers then; and 31, 12, 10 a processional song, *carmen*, *sicut patrum memoria Livius, ita tum condidit P. Licinius Tegula*. Of similar import are the remarks about the ancient obedience 3, 29, 3; and modesty 10, 9, 6.

*Economic and Social.*—Old economic and social conditions seem to have been continually before the mind of Livy, and he freely calls attention to the steep decline since the good old days: 1, 2, 3 *Caere opulento tum oppido*; 1, 3, 3 *florentem iam, ut tum res erant, atque opulentam*; 2, 50, 2; 2, 63, 6; 1, 9, 7 *quanto apparatu tum sciebant aut poterant*; 2, 7, 4; 5, 13, 7; 39, 6, 7; 4, 45, 2 *indicibus dena milia gravis aeris, quae tum divitiae habebantur, ex aerario numerata*. The absence of *basilicae* is mentioned 26, 27, 3; the mines of Spain as a source of wealth 34, 21, 7; the early fame of Corinth 45, 28, 2; and the inexperience of the early Romans in presenting spectacles 45, 32, 10. Notice is taken 3, 6, 1 of the beginning of the new year; 5, 41, 9 of the wearing of beards; 39, 6, 9 the recognition of cooking as an art; 10, 47, 3 the introduction from Greece of the practice of presenting palms to the victors in the games; and 39, 22, 2 the first contests of athletes.

#### PRIMUS. PRIMUM.

In a number of the passages quoted under *tum*, *primum* is also used definitely marking the beginning of a new order of things. Attention is frequently called to the first holder of an office continuing to the time of Livy, and also to the first performance of some action which had been perpetuated among the Romans.

Livy speaks of the men who were the first of the plebs elected to various offices, and of these a list is given in a speech 10, 8, 8: 3, 54, 12; and 6, 37, 8 *tribune*; 7, 6, 8 *consul*; 7, 17, 6 *magister*

equitum ; 7, 22, 7 dictator ; 8, 15, 9 praetor ; 27, 8, 3 maximus curio. It is said of Ancus 1, 35, 2 that he was the first to use demagogic tactics with the plebs ; compare similar remarks about Manlius 6, 11, 7 and 6, 20, 4 : that Servius 1, 41, 6 primus iniussu populi voluntate patrum regnavit ; that Tarquin 1, 49, 7 primus traditum a prioribus morem de omnibus senatum consulendi solvit ; 8, 26, 7 two new honors given to Publilius ; 9, 20, 5 the election of praefect at Capua ; 2, 5, 9 ille primum dicitur vindicta liberatus, cf., 3, 13, 8 ; 38, 16, 14 stipendium . . . primus Asiam incolentium abnuit Attalus ; cf. 37, 52, 7 ; 40, 44, 1 the fixing of the legal age for candidates.

*Military.*—Account is taken of the fact 1, 53, 2 that Tarquin stirred up a war with the Volsci that lasted for 200 years ; 9, 41, 4 the Marsi first battling with the Romans ; 7, 5, 9 the election of tribunes by the suffrage of the soldiers ; 10, 31, 10 the consuls first carrying on war with the Samnites, cf. 31, 1, 4 ; 40, 38, 9 the first triumph without a war.

*Religious.*—1, 10, 7 the first temple is mentioned ; 27, 23, 7 the first vowing of perpetual games ; and 25, 40, 2 the beginning of admiration for Greek art and of despoiling things both sacred and profane.

*Social.*—8, 20, 2 carceres set up in the circus ; 10, 47, 3 crowned spectators at the games ; 24, 43, 7 scenic games presented by the curule aediles ; and 36, 36, 4 some information gathered from Antias, quos primos scenicos fuisse Antias Valerius est auctor, Megalesia appellatos. And to close the lists may be given 30, 45, 7 the first taking of a name from the conquered country. Similar to these are the passages in which certain things are spoken of as *nova* : 1, 7, 8, literature among unskilled men ; 5, 2, 1 winter quarters ; 7, 2, 3 ludi scaenici nova res bellicoso populo ; 42, 65, 9 hoc illo bello novum genus teli inventum est.

#### ANTE. ANTEA.

Statements containing *ante* with a negative differ from those with *primum* only in form, *primum* asserting the beginning of something and *ante* denying its existence before a certain time. Some are general statements, or indicate a new order of things or a new event more important than the preceding, and nearly all of them refer to political and military happenings.

*Ante.*—1, 42, 5 the character of the burdens imposed by Servius ; 1, 46, 1 the unanimity with which he was proclaimed king ; 2, 22,

7 the close union between Roman and Latin ; 2, 30, 7 the size of the army ; 2, 46, 2 the high spirit of the Romans ; also 9, 39, 5 ; 2, 9, 3 the terror at the invasion of Porsina ; 27, 33, 7 the killing of two consuls in war—*quod nullo ante bello acciderat*—; 2, 61, 3 the hatred shown to a prisoner ; 3, 63, 9 a unique honor ; also 8, 26, 7 ; 45, 42, 12 ships drawn up in the Campus Martius ; 39, 56, 6 the appearance of a new island. Similar statements are also found in speeches : of Scipio 26, 45, 9 *vias ante numquam initas humano vestigio aperirent* ; and of Fabius 28, 40, 10 *quod fando numquam ante auditum erat, imperium mecum aequaretur*. Religious conditions are mentioned : 5, 23, 3 a supplication for four days ; and 22, 57, 6 human sacrifices in the ox forum. Instead of the adverb the preposition *ante* is used in a few passages : 8, 18, 11 *neque de beneficiis ante eam diem Romae quaesitum est* ; 22, 8, 6 the election of a dictator by the people ; and 42, 1, 8 *ante hunc consulem nemo umquam sociis ulla re oneri aut sumptui fuit* ; 4, 59, 11 *decerneret senatus, ut stipendium miles de publico acciperet, cum ante id tempus de suo quisque functus eo munere est*.

*Antea*.—*Antea* is occasionally used with a negative as in 9, 37, 2 ; 22, 38, 2 ; and in a speech 23, 23, 1. However, it is found most commonly in affirmative announcements. It is used twice in the discussion of the Roman army 8, 8, 3 *clipeis antea Romani usi sunt ; dein, postquam stipendarii facti sunt, scuta pro clipeis fecere ; et quod antea phalanges similes Macedonibus, hos postea manipulatim structa acies coepit esse*. It also occurs 2, 58, 1 in a criticism of Piso ; 9, 30, 3 the election of tribunes of the soldiers by the people though this had previously been the function of the dictators and consuls ; and 45, 21, 5 the trespassing by a praetor on the prerogatives of the senate. Attention is called 5, 23, 4 to the fact that unparalleled crowds greeted the arrival of Camillus ; and 38, 50, 10, of Scipio on his way to trial. The condition of roads is stated 27, 39, 7 ; and 39, 45, 6.

#### AETAS. SAECULUM. TEMPUS. TEMPESTAS.

Nouns indicating time are also used with the demonstrative pronouns to indicate the period with which the contrast is made.

*Aetas*.—1, 18, 1 *consultissimus vir, ut in illa quisquam esse aetate poterat* ; 1, 57, 1 *Ardeam Rutuli habebant, gens, ut in ea regione atque ea aetate, divitiis praepollens* ; 8, 13, 9 *statua—rara illa aetate res—* ; 9, 16, 19, *haud dubie illa aetate, qua nulla virtutum feracior fuit, nemo unus erat vir, quo magis innixa res Romana staret*.

*Saeculum*.—1, 19, 4 rem ad multitudinem imperitam et illis saeculis rudem efficacissimam.

*Tempus*.—3, 55, 12 quae refellitur interpretatio quod illis temporibus . . . mos fuerat ; 4, 13, 1 ut illis temporibus praedives. 10, 46, 2 insigni, ut illorum temporum habitus erat, triumpho ; 29, 37, 16 ; 7, 3, 6 eum clavum, quia rarae per ea tempora litterae erant, notam numeri annorum fuisse ferunt.

*Tempestas*.—*Tempestas* is found in a larger number of passages, referring to past conditions contrasted with the present, and also to temporary measures. A common use is with an adjective, *ea tempestate* designating the time for which the statement was true. 1, 30, 4 genti ea t. secundum Etruscos opulentissimae viris armisque ; 23, 28, 10 ; 28, 18, 1. Other adjectives are found : 37, 8, 4 bellicosior ; 9, 7, 15 clarior ; 1, 56, 6 ignotus ; 1, 18, 1 ; 1, 36, 3 ; 26, 11, 8 inclutus ; 30, 1, 4 instructor ; 23, 15, 8 nobilis ; 25, 24, 11 pulcherrima ; 10, 30, 10, spernenda ; 9, 29, 2 terribilior. 4, 20, 3 quae prima opima appellata sola ea tempestate.

In other passages the reference is rather to temporary conditions, e. g. 5, 45, 1 aequis iniquisque persuasum erat tantum bello virum neminem usquam ea tempestate esse ; and in more than a score of other passages.

Past conditions are sometimes expressed by the verb alone, e. g. 2, 40, 11 adeo sine obrectatione gloriae vivebatur ; and 28, 34, 7 mos vetustus erat Romanis.

#### PARENTHETIC COMPARISONS.

We have noticed nearly 100 passages in which *qualis* or *ut* is used with some verb usually *adsolet*, *solet* or *fit*. These are used in calling attention to the general character of the facts stated, while *ut mos est* is added in regard to events both native and foreign. While these additions do not increase the number of facts recorded by Livy, yet most of them are general in character, and indicate that his view extended beyond the specific facts set forth. An illustration of the most common forms of comparison will suffice: 7, 2, 4 parva ut ferme principia omnia ; 23, 24, 12 purgato inde capite, ut mos iis est, calvam auro caelavere ; 9, 13, 7 molliore atque, ut evenit fere, locis simili genere ; 22, 22, 6 tum, qualia plerumque sunt barbarorum ingenia, cum fortuna mutaverat fidem ; 34, 54, 4 praebuit sermones, sicut omnis novitas solet ; 28, 24, 6 licentia ex diutino, ut fit, otio conlecto.

## REFERENCES TO THE READER.

The references either direct or indirect to the reader are here added as a counterpart of what has been given, and though the value of these is not historical, yet they impart a rhetorical tinge to Livy's work. The larger number are in the subjunctive, and while grammatically they are to be assigned to the indefinite 'one', some of them were perhaps originally intended to be applied to the person to whom were addressed the stories of which they form a part.

The present indicative is used in a question 9, 18, 11 *quintu . . . confers?* with nearly the force of an imperative. The latter mood is found in the stereotyped form *adice nunc* 34, 50, 7, and, in the more personal section dealing with Alexander 9, 19, 6 *adde, quod Romanis ad manum domi supplementum esset, Alexandro . . . exercitus consensuisset*. The present participle *legentibus* is found 6, 12, 2; and 9, 17, 1, the same as *legentium* and *festinantibus* in Praef. 4; 9, 17, 4 *ea et singula intuenti et universa*. The subjunctive is freely used in the different prefaces, and is not uncommon throughout the narrative portions.

*Present.*—The second person of the present subjunctive is used in the prefaces directly addressed to the reader. Other remarks intended for the reader are called out because of the uncertainty of statements found in the annals: 22, 61, 10 *mirari magis adeo discrepare inter auctores, quam, quid veri sit, discernere queas*; 25, 17, 7 *si illis . . . credere velis*; 42, 11, 1 *annales plurium, et quibus credidisse malis*; 44, 13, 12 *si Valerio Antiati credas, cf. 33, 10, 8 si qui credat*. References are also made to other matters: 22, 54, 10 *compares cladem ad Aegatis insulas*; 30, 26, 9 *sicut dubites . . . sic nihil certius est*; 32, 4, 4 *repente velut maris vasti, sic universa panditur planities, ut subiectos campos terminare oculis haud facile queas*; 38, 53, 10 *quid ad primum consulatum secundus, etiam si censuram adicias*; 44, 41, 7 *si . . . circumagere . . . cogas confusa strue implicantur*. An indirect appeal is made to the reader 10, 31, 15 *quinam sit ille quem pigeat longinquitatis bellorum scribendo legendoque quae gerentes non fatigaverunt*. Compare with this use of the present, the indirect statements in 2, 3, 3 *regem hominem esse, a quo impetres, ubi ius, ubi iniuria opus sit; leges rem surdam . . . nihil laxamenti nec veniae, habere si modum excesseris*; and

31, 48, 10 et pugnandum esse interdum, non quia velis, sed quia hostis cogat.

*Perfect.*—4, 6, 12 altitudinem animi ubi nunc in uno inveneris, quae tum universi populi fuit. The account of the road to the Caudine Forks is put into a personal form 9, 2, 8 sed ante venias ad eum, intrandae angustiae sunt, et aut eadem, qua te insinuaveris, retro via repetenda aut, si ire porro pergas, per alium saltum . . . evadendum; and also the description of Cato 39, 40, 9 nec facile dixeris, utrum magis presserit eum nobilitas, an ille agitaverit nobilitatem. Compare the indirect statement of the words of Philip 28, 8, 4 nec pro difficile id bellum habendum, in quo si modo congressus cum hostibus sis, viceris.

*Imperfect.*—The imperfect is the tense most freely used, and occurrences of a dozen different verbs are found, a number of them in conditional statements: *aestimares* 29, 26, 2 si magnitudine classes a.; *cederes* 36, 32, 5 erat Quinctius sicut adversantibus asper, ita, si cederes, idem placabilis; *cerneres* 22, 7, 12 inde varios vultus digredientium ab nuntiis c.; 42, 30, 1 principum diversa c. studia; *conferres* 37, 59, 2 non magis comparandus, quam si imperatorem imperatori aut Antiochum ducem Hannibali c.; *consuleres* 39, 40, 6 idem in pace, si ius c., peritissimus, si causa oranda esset, eloquentissimus; *crederes* 2, 43, 9 maestique, c. victos . . . redeunt in castra; 22, 46, 4 Afros Romanam magna ex parte c. aciem; 30, 32, 11 vultuque ita laeto, ut vicisse iam c., dicebat; 40, 50, 3 fere victos c.; *diceres* 2, 35, 5 quidquid erat patrum reos d.; 29, 28, 3 ut relinqui subito Africam d.; 39, 40, 5 ut natum ad id unum d., quidcumque ageret (Cato); *discerneres* 21, 4, 3 haud facile d., utrum imperatori an exercitui carior esset; *intenderes* 3, 11, 2 manu obtinendum erat, quod intenderes; *nescires* 3, 35, 3 n. utrum inter decemviros an inter candidatos numerares; *numerares* 2, 1, 7 libertatis autem originem inde magis . . . n.; *sentires* 41, 13, 8 taciti ut iratos esse sentires, secuti sunt currum; *sperneres* 2, 49, 4 quorum neminem ducem s.; *videres* 28, 30, 9 et fugientem navem v. vertice retro intortam victoribus inlatam; 30, 10, 17 scindi v. vincula; 44, 34, 7 neminem totis mox castris quietum videres. Here may also be given a few indefinite interrogatives: 1, 3, 2 haud ambigam—quis enim rem tam veterem pro certo adfirmet? also 27, 1, 13; 28, 12, 6 cui non videatur mirabile nullum motum in castris factum?

## SUMMARY.

Several of the above references are at times found within a single passage so that the number of including passages is considerably less than the number of references. While this is true, there is a large number of independent sections into which Livy has introduced remarks not demanded by a bare recital of facts. Some of these may be justly held as belonging to his sources, but those certainly due to Livy are numerous, and from them the following facts are established:

1. Livy freely admits his skepticism in regard to early Roman history, and in so doing makes most of the references to himself.

2. References to his sources are largely indefinite, and when earlier writers are mentioned it is for isolated facts, or for purposes of criticism.

3. Livy sought to connect past and present through the use of *nunc*, *tunc*, etc., and to give an air of universality to specific statements by using *ut fit*, *ut solet*, etc.

4. Through the use of the second person of the verb, the reader is made a quasi-associate to witness and to pass judgment on what is presented.

5. The frank acknowledgment of the existence of difficulties, and of the inability to solve them is characteristic of Livy, and is one of the merits of his work.

VANDERBILT UNIVERSITY, NASHVILLE, TENN.

R. B. STEELE.